## IN THE UNITED STATES COURT OF APPEALS FOR THE FIFTH CIRCUIT

NOV 2 9 2016

David J. Bradley, Clerk of Court

No. 15-20499

D.C. Docket No. 4:14-CV-237

United States Court of Appeals Fifth Circuit

**FILED** 

October 18, 2016

Lyle W. Cayce Clerk

APACHE CORPORATION,

Plaintiff - Appellee Cross-Appellant

v.

GREAT AMERICAN INSURANCE COMPANY,

Defendant - Appellant Cross-Appellee

Appeals from the United States District Court for the Southern District of Texas, Houston

Before JOLLY, BARKSDALE, and SOUTHWICK, Circuit Judges.

## JUDGMENT

This cause was considered on the record on appeal and was argued by counsel.

It is ordered and adjudged that the judgment of the District Court is vacated and rendered for Great American Insurance Company.

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that plaintiff-appellee cross-appellant pay to defendant-appellant cross-appellee the costs on appeal to be taxed by the Clerk of this Court.



Certified as a true copy and issued as the mandate on Nov 29, 2016

Attest: July W. Canca

Clerk, U.S. Court of Appears, Fifth Circuit

## **United States Court of Appeals**

OFFICE OF THE CLERK

LYLE W. CAYCE CLERK

TEL. 504-310-7700 600 S. MAESTRI PLACE **NEW ORLEANS, LA 70130** 

November 29, 2016

Mr. David J. Bradley Southern District of Texas, Houston United States District Court 515 Rusk Street Room 5300 Houston, TX 77002

> No. 15-20499 Apache Corporation v. Great American Insurance Co. USDC No. 4:14-CV-237

Dear Mr. Bradley,

Enclosed is a copy of the judgment issued as the mandate and a copy of the court's opinion.

Enclosed for the district court and counsel is the approved bill of costs.

Sincerely,

LYLE W. CAYCE, Clerk Jem de Montlurin

By:

James deMontluzin, Deputy Clerk 504-310-7679

Mr. David H. Brown

Mrs. Carla Cash Crapster
Mr. Michael Albert Graziano
Mr. Harris Bruce Katz
Mr. Michael Keeley

Ms. Deborah Carleton Milner
Mr. Patrick W. Mizell
Mr. Francis Joseph Nealon
Mr. Martin Samuel Schexnayder

Mr. Garry T. Stevens Jr. Mr. William Gaynor Winget